Photo caption

Critical Challenge

Critical tasks
A. Select the photograph that best shows the quality of the community that you have been assigned.

B. Match a photograph with the most appropriate caption.

Overview
In this two-part challenge, students are asked to take a photograph that depicts a previously chosen feature or quality of their community (e.g., friendly, dangerous, fun). Other students try to match the quality with the photograph and explain why the photograph reflects this quality.

Objectives

Broad understanding
The qualities of a community can be recognized in everyday scenes.

Requisite tools

Background knowledge
• knowledge of a community
• how to use a camera

Criteria for judgment
• features of a good photograph (e.g., fits a caption, has sufficient detail)
• criteria for an appropriate match (e.g., caption fits evidence in the photograph)

Critical thinking vocabulary
• evidence, reasons

Thinking strategies

Habits of mind
Suggested Activities

Pre-planning

➢ Secure enough cameras so that there is one for each group of four students. Cameras that produce an immediate image are preferable for this activity (i.e., digital, polaroid).

➢ To complete these challenges students should be familiar with the qualities that characterize a successful community.

Session One Blackline Master #1

➢ Ask students to brainstorm words (adjectives) that describe their community environment (e.g., friendly, happy, fun, dirty). Write each word (or phrase) on a separate index card and place the cards in a large envelope. These words are now captions. Students in pairs choose a card from the envelope without looking. Each pair of students keeps the card (with caption) they picked to themselves.

➢ Explain to students that they will go out into the school grounds (or the neighbouring community) with a partner to take three photographs that show the quality indicated on their index card. Encourage students to take different angles of the same scene, or take photographs of different scenes.

➢ Before sending students out, discuss the criteria of a good picture. This may be done by sharing several photographs of varying quality that you have taken to represent a particular quality (e.g., a happy family). Ask students to identify notable features about each photograph. Three criteria are particularly key for this activity:
  • the image is large enough to be recognizable
  • there are sufficient details to send a message
  • the image matches the caption.

➢ If desired, show students a set of three photographs of varying quality that represent a common feature (e.g., a sad family). Using Selecting a good photograph (Blackline Master #1) as a guide, rate how well each photograph meets the specified criteria. Discuss which photograph best shows the identified quality.
If students are unfamiliar with the use of cameras, provide instructions and a few tips for taking good photographs. Cameras that produce photographs immediately are most appropriate for this activity.

**Session Two**

- Working in groups, ask students to take three photographs within the school grounds (or in the neighbouring community) that capture the particular quality of the community they have been assigned.

- When students have returned to the class with their photographs, introduce the first critical task to the class:

  *Select the photograph that best shows the quality of the community that you have been assigned.*

  Review the criteria for a good photograph and help each pair of students use Blackline Master #1 to rate the three photographs on each of the criteria before selecting the best one to represent the assigned caption.

- When each pair has selected its best photograph, tape all the captions on one part of the board and all the photographs on another part.

- Present the second critical task to the class:

  *Match a photograph with the most appropriate caption.*

  Each pair takes a turn pointing to their picture (without revealing which is their caption) while other members of the class guess which caption belongs with the picture and explain why they think it fits.

- Allow the class three guesses for each picture. If a guess is correct or after three failed guesses, the pair explains to the class what caption their picture represents and gives their reason for taking this picture to represent their caption.
Session Three  Blackline Master #2

➤ Use either of the following activities to check for understanding by inviting students to match pictures to captions and explain reasons for their choice(s).

With younger students, place the captions in a pocket chart or attach to a board. Play a matching game by inviting students to choose one or more photographs that they think matches the captions. Ask them to place the photograph next to the caption and give reasons for their choice. This may be done in pairs or individually.

With older students, provide each student with a copy of Matching captions (Blackline Master #2) and invite them to choose a caption, find the best picture from those available and write the reasons for their choice. Multiple copies of pictures can be photocopied if necessary for this activity.

Evaluation  Blackline Master #3

➤ Assess students’ ability to select a good picture to represent the assigned quality using the first criteria on Assessing photograph selection and interpretation (Blackline Master #3). The sources of evidence for making this assessment are the students’ photographs and/or their responses on Selecting a good photograph (Blackline Master #1).

➤ Assess students’ ability to match captions with photographs and to provide evidence from a picture to support a choice using the second criteria on Assessing photograph selection and interpretation (Blackline Master #3). The sources of evidence for making this assessment are:
  - For younger students, use responses from the matching game as they give reasons orally for choosing the picture to match their caption.
• For older students, use responses on *Matching captions* (Blackline Master #2) to judge their reasons and use of evidence from the picture.

Reaching the “basic understanding” level on the rubric may be appropriate for early primary students.

**Extension**

➤ Discuss with the class whether any of the photographs changed how students viewed their community.

➤ Look for and discuss similarities and differences among the pictures.

➤ Invite students to create new captions for the pictures.

➤ Invite students to locate and assemble magazine photographs that depict the original captions of the community to create a neighbourhood montage.
Selecting a good photograph

**Picture #1**
- Is it large enough to see? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Do the details help us understand the picture? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Does it match the caption? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]

**Picture #2**
- Is it large enough to see? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Do the details help us understand the picture? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Does it match the caption? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]

**Picture #3**
- Is it large enough to see? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Do the details help us understand the picture? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]
- Does it match the caption? (YES) [ ] (SO-SO) [ ] (NO) [ ]

1 [ ]

We think picture 2 [ ] is the best picture because

3 [ ]
Matching captions

Caption: ________________________________________________

This picture is a good choice for this caption because it shows ____________________________
_____________________________________________________________________________________
_____________________________________________________________________________________
_____________________________________________________________________________________

Extension

This picture could also be used with the caption ____________________________
because ____________________________
_____________________________________________________________________________________
_____________________________________________________________________________________

The Critical Thinking Consortium
Assessing photograph selection and interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sophisticated understanding</th>
<th>Extended understanding</th>
<th>Basic understanding</th>
<th>Partial recognition</th>
<th>Pre-recognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uses criteria to select a good photograph</td>
<td>Uses all the criteria to select a good photograph and offers an explanation using these criteria.</td>
<td>Uses more than one criteria in selecting a good photograph.</td>
<td>Can use one of the criteria to select a good photograph.</td>
<td>Understands what is asked, but does not use the criteria to select a good photograph.</td>
<td>Does not understand what it means to use criteria to select a good photograph.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matches relevant caption to photograph</td>
<td>Can provide several reasons for matching a photograph with the relevant caption and may extend evidence to support a second caption.</td>
<td>Can match photographs with relevant captions, and identify one piece of evidence to explain each choice.</td>
<td>Can match very obvious photographs with the relevant captions, but has difficulty providing reasons.</td>
<td>Understands what it means to match a photograph with the relevant caption, but does not successfully do so.</td>
<td>Does not understand what it means to match a photograph with the relevant caption.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments: